Winston Churchill’s Rhetorical Devices
From “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric”
Four AP English Lesson by Eileen Bach

Objective 1: To examine excerpts from Churchill’s writing to learn and identify four of the principal elements Churchill believes are the “foundation of all rhetoric: the correctness of diction (identifying qualifiers and their contribution to ethos, logos and/or pathos), rhythm (staccato lines and balanced antitheses), accumulation of argument and analogies.

Objective 2: To acquaint upcoming generations with the writing and oratory of Winston Churchill, the author of more than forty books of biography, history, essays and speeches, and winner of the Nobel Prize in Literature.

Objective 3: To offer Churchill’s unfinished essay, “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric” as advice for young writers.

THE ORGANIZATION OF THIS LESSON PLAN:

Part 2: Four Work Sheets and Answer Keys
I. Correctness of Diction pages 1-3 (work sheets and answer keys)
II. Rhythm pages 4-6 (work sheets and answer keys)
III. Accumulation of Argument (underlining inclusive words) pages 7-10 (work sheets and answer keys)
IV. a. Analogy pages 11-13 (work sheets and answer keys)
IV. b. Allusions as implied Analogies pages 14-16 (work sheets and answer keys)
Part 3: (Optional) Full text of “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric”

PART I: THE SCAFFOLDING OF RHETORIC

When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.”

This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail: Correctness of diction (the qualifier’s appeal to ethos, logos and/or pathos), rhythm (staccato and balanced antitheses), accumulation of argument and analogy, including allusions as implied analogies. In the following four lessons, let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work. Though Churchill never finished this essay, he went on to win the Nobel Prize in Literature in 1953.

All excerpts from Churchill’s works are from documents in The Churchill Archives Centre at Churchill College, University of Cambridge. The identification information in parentheses refers to a specific document or folder in The Archives.
When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work. Letters and numbers in parentheses following each quote are document identification information from The Churchill Archives Centre.

“I. CORRECTNESS OF DICTION. There is no more important element in the technique of rhetoric than the continual employment of the best possible word….The unreflecting often imagine that the effects of oratory are produced by the use of long words….The shorter words of a language are usually the more ancient. Their meaning is more ingrained in the national character and they appeal with greater force to simple understandings than words recently introduced from the Latin and the Greek.”

Read the sentences below from Churchill speeches in 1940 and 1941 and focus on the qualifiers Churchill chooses to strengthen his message; what does the qualifier (in bold type) add? Consider whether the qualifier contributes to the rhetorical element of ethos (authority or credibility), logos (logic) and/or pathos (emotion) and explain your choice. A chart for completion follows.

1. “This wicked man [Hitler], the repository and embodiment of many forms of soul-destroying hatred, this monstrous product of former wrongs and shame, has now resolved to try to break our famous island race by a process of indiscriminant slaughter and destruction” September 11, 1940 (1.6 CHAR 9/144/67)

2. “Neither the sudden shock of battle nor the long-drawn trials of vigilance and exertion will wear us down.” February 9, 1941 (2.1 CHAR 9/150A/75)

3. “During the last year we have gained by our bearing and conduct a potent hold upon the sentiments of the people of the United States. Never, never in our history, have we been held in such admiration and regard across the Atlantic Ocean. In that great Republic, now in much travail and stress of soul, it is customary to use all the many valid, solid arguments about American interests and American safety, which depend upon the destruction of Hitler and his foul gang and even fouler doctrines. But in the long run - believe me, for I know - the action of the United States will be dictated, not by methodical calculations of profit and loss, but by moral sentiment, and by that gleaming flash of resolve which lifts the hearts of men and nations, and springs from the spiritual foundations of human life itself.” April 27, 1941 (3.1 CHAR 9/150B/129)

4. “No prudent and far-seeing man can doubt that the eventual and total defeat of Hitler and Mussolini is certain, in view of the respective declared resolves of the British and American democracies. There are less than seventy million malignant Huns - some of whom are curable and others killable – most of whom are already engaged in holding down Austrians, Czechs, Poles, and many other ancient races they now bully and pilage.” April 27, 1941 (3.2 CHAR 9/150B/140)

5. “I have the honour to add a pendant to the necklace of that Christmas good will and kindliness with which my illustrious friend, the President, has encircled the homes and families of the United States by the message of Christmas eve which he has just delivered.” December 25, 1941 (5.1 CHAR 9/153/3)

6. “Ill would it be for us this Christmastide if we were not sure that no greed for the land or wealth of any other people, no vulgar ambition, no sordid lust for material gain at the expense of others, had led us to the field.” December 25, 1941 (5.2 CHAR 9/153/4)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document 1: CHAR 9/144/67</th>
<th>Qualifier: soul-destroying indiscriminate</th>
<th>Noun modified: hatred slaughter</th>
<th>Observation:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document 2: CHAR 9/150A/75</td>
<td>Qualifier: long-drawn</td>
<td>Noun modified: trials</td>
<td>Observation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 3: CHAR9/150B/129</td>
<td>Qualifier: foul, fouler gleaming</td>
<td>Noun modified: gang, doctrines flash of resolve</td>
<td>Observation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 4: CHAR9/150B/140</td>
<td>Qualifier: prudent malignant</td>
<td>Noun modified: Man Huns</td>
<td>Observation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 5: CHAR 9/153/3</td>
<td>Qualifier: illustrious</td>
<td>Noun modified: friends</td>
<td>Observation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 6: CHAR 9/153/4</td>
<td>Qualifier: vulgar sordid</td>
<td>Noun modified: ambition lust</td>
<td>Observation:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## I. CORRECTNESS OF DICTION – ANSWER KEY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document 1: CHAR 9/144/67</th>
<th>Qualifier: soul-destroying indiscriminate</th>
<th>Noun modified: hatred slaughter</th>
<th>Observation: “Soul-destroying” is an example of pathos, for references to the soul bring out strong emotions, particularly paired with “destroying.” “Indiscriminate” suggests the cruelty of random violence which can’t be prevented.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document 2: CHAR 9/150A/75</td>
<td>Qualifier: long-drawn</td>
<td>Noun modified: trials</td>
<td>Observation: “Long-drawn is an example of logos, for it explains what makes the trials especially difficult, as well as suggesting pathos, for something long-drawn may become emotional.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 3: CHAR9/150B/129</td>
<td>Qualifier: foul, fouler gleaning</td>
<td>Noun modified: gang, doctrines flash of resolve</td>
<td>Observation: This escalation to the comparative form (foul, fouler) is an example of pathos, increasing one’s distaste. “Gleaming” suggests that resolve is shining and therefore is something good, light in the darkness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 4: CHAR9/150B/140</td>
<td>Qualifier: prudent malignant</td>
<td>Noun modified: Man Huns</td>
<td>Observation: “Prudent” suggests credibility and authority and so may be considered an appeal to ethos while “malignant” has negative connotations and is an example of pathos, evoking negative emotions, suggesting a deadly disease.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 5: CHAR 9/153/3</td>
<td>Qualifier: illustrious</td>
<td>Noun modified: friends</td>
<td>Observation: “Illustrious” suggests credibility and authority and so may be considered an appeal to ethos; one might also argue it is logos if it is logical that one would refer only to such friends, but it is most likely pathos, an appeal to emotion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document 6: CHAR 9/153/4</td>
<td>Qualifier: vulgar sordid</td>
<td>Noun modified: ambition lust</td>
<td>Observation: Our animal drives of ambition and lust are rendered more ugly when qualified as vulgar and sordid, words with strong negative connotations suggesting a lack of control.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Scaffolding of Rhetoric II
II. Rhythm – Work Sheet

When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work. Letters and numbers in parentheses following each quote are document identification information from The Churchill Archives Centre.

“II. RHYTHM. The great influence of sound on the human brain is well known. The sentences of the orator when he appeals to his art become long, rolling and sonorous. The peculiar balance of the phrases produces a cadence which resembles blank verse rather than prose.”

Read the following excerpts and note how the syntax (sentence structure) contributes to the meaning of the work. In particular, seek and underline the staccato lines and balanced antitheses that help to create the cadences Churchill composes.

**STACCATO LINES:** Staccato lines are short lines or phrases in rapid succession, such as “I came, I saw, I conquered,” or “Loves me, loves me not,” or “You think so? No big deal.”

1. “What is the answer that I shall give in your name to this great man [Roosevelt], the thrice-chosen head of a nation of a hundred and thirty million? Here is the answer. Put your confidence in us; give us your faith and your blessing, and under Providence all will be well. We shall not fail or falter. We shall not weaken or tire. Neither the sudden shock of battle nor the long-drawn trials of vigilance and exertion will wear us down. Give us the tools and we will finish the job.” February 9, 1941 (2.1 CHAR 9/150A/75)

2. “But time is short. Every month that passes adds to the length and the perils of the journey that will have to be made. United we stand. Divided we fall. Divided, the dark ages return. United, we can save and guide the world.” June 16, 1941 (4.3 CHAR 9/151/86)

3. “It is not possible to form a just judgment of a public figure who has attained the enormous dimensions of Adolf Hitler until his life work as a whole is before us. Although no subsequent political action can condone wrong deeds, history is replete with examples of men who have risen to power by employing stern, grim, and even frightful methods, but who, nevertheless, when their life is revealed as a whole, have been regarded as great figures whose lives have enriched the story of mankind. So may it be with Hitler.” ‘The Truth About Hitler,’ The Strand Magazine, November 1, 1935 (9.16 CHAR8/518A/34)

**BALANCED ANTITHESSES:** Balanced antitheses are opposites, such as “This car may be old, but it runs great,” or “You’d think this would be complicated, but it is really quite easy,” or “Marathons are arduous yet satisfying.”

4. “In that great Republic [America], now in much travail and stress of soul, it is customary to use all the many valid, solid arguments about American interests and American safety, which depend upon the destruction of Hitler and his foul gang and even fouler doctrines.

But in the long run - believe me, for I know - the action of the United States will be dictated, not by methodical calculations of profit and loss, but by moral sentiment, and by that gleaming flash of resolve which lifts the hearts of men and nations, and springs from the spiritual foundations of human life itself.” April 27, 1941 Broadcast (3.1 CHAR 9/150B/129)
II. Rhythm – Work Sheet (page 2)

5. “While therefore we naturally view with sorrow and anxiety much that is happening in Europe and in Africa, and may happen in Asia, we must not lose our sense of proportion and thus become discouraged or alarmed. When we face with a steady eye the difficulties which lie before us, we may derive new confidence from remembering those we have already overcome. Nothing that is happening now is comparable in gravity with the dangers through which we passed last year. Nothing that can happen in the East is comparable with what is happening in the West.” April 27, 1941 Broadcast (3.3 CHAR 9/150B/141)
STACCATO LINES: Staccato lines are short lines or phrases in rapid succession, such as “I came, I saw, I conquered,” or “Loves me, loves me not,” or “You think so? No big deal.” Consider compound sentences separated by a semi-colon the same as you would sentences separated by a period.

1. “What is the answer that I shall give in your name to this great man [Roosevelt], the thrice-chosen head of a nation of a hundred and thirty million? Here is the answer. Put your confidence in us; give us your faith and your blessing, and under Providence all will be well. We shall not fail or falter. We shall not weaken or tire. Neither the sudden shock of battle nor the long-drawn trials of vigilance and exertion will wear us down. Give us the tools and we will finish the job.” Broadcast, February 9, 1941 (2.1 CHAR 9/150A/75)

2. “But time is short. Every month that passes adds to the length and the perils of the journey that will have to be made. United we stand. Divided we fall. Divided, the dark ages return. United, we can save and guide the world.” June 16, 1941 (4.3 CHAR 9/151/86)

BALANCED ANTITHESSES: Balanced antitheses are opposites, such as “This car may be old, but it runs great,” or “You’d think this would be complicated, but it is really quite easy,” or “Marathons are arduous yet satisfying.”

3. “It is not possible to form a just judgment of a public figure who has attained the enormous dimensions of Adolf Hitler until his life work as a whole is before us. Although no subsequent political action can condone wrong deeds, history is replete with examples of men who have risen to power by employing stern, grim, and even frightful methods, but who, nevertheless, when their life is revealed as a whole, have been regarded as great figures whose lives have enriched the story of mankind. So may it be with Hitler.” ‘The Truth About Hitler,’ The Strand Magazine, November 1, 1935 (9.16 CHAR8/518A/34)

4. But in the long run - believe me, for I know - the action of the United States will be dictated, not by methodical calculations of profit and loss, but by moral sentiment, and by that gleaming flash of resolve which lifts the hearts of men and nations, and springs from the spiritual foundations of human life itself.” April 27, 1941 Broadcast (3.1 CHAR 9/150B/129)

5. “While therefore we naturally view with sorrow and anxiety much that is happening in Europe and in Africa, and may happen in Asia, we must not lose our sense of proportion and thus become discouraged or alarmed. When we face with a steady eye the difficulties which lie before us, we may derive new confidence from remembering those we have already overcome. Nothing that is happening now is comparable in gravity with the dangers through which we passed last year. Nothing that can happen in the East is comparable with what is happening in the West.” April 27, 1941 Broadcast (3.3 CHAR 9/150B/141)
When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work. Letters and numbers in parentheses following each quote are document identification information from The Churchill Archives Centre.

“III. ACCUMULATION OF ARGUMENT. The climax of oratory is reached by a rapid succession of waves of sound and vivid pictures. The audience is delighted by the changing scenes presented to their imagination. Their ear is tickled by the rhythm of the language. The enthusiasm rises. A series of facts is brought forward all pointing in a common direction. The end appears in view before it is reached. The crowd anticipate the conclusion and the last words fall amid a thunder of assent.”

Accumulation of argument is more difficult to discern in extracts exhibited here. However, if you read the following excerpts and underline the words that reveal Churchill’s determination to be inclusive, you will have a sense of his desire to have all aspects “brought forward all pointing in a common direction”:

1. Therefore, we must regard the next week or so as a very important period in our history. It ranks with the days when the Spanish Armada was approaching the Channel, and Drake was finishing his game of bowls; or when Nelson stood between us and Napoleon's Grand Army at Boulogne. We have read all about this in the history books; but what is happening now is on a far greater scale and of far more consequence to the life and future of the world and its civilization than these brave old days of the past. Every man and woman will therefore prepare himself to do his duty, whatever it may be, with special pride and care. Our fleets and flotillas are very powerful and numerous; our Air Force is at the highest strength it has ever reached, and it is conscious of its proved superiority, not indeed in numbers, but in men and machines. Our shores are well fortified and strongly manned, and behind them, ready to attack the invaders, we have a far larger and better equipped mobile Army than we have ever had before. Besides this, we have more than a million and a half men of the Home Guard, who are just as much soldiers of the Regular Army as the Grenadier Guards, and who are determined to fight for every inch of the ground in every village and in every street.

Broadcast on September 11, 1940 (1.4 CHAR 9/176A/40 )

2. Little does he know the spirit of the British nation, or the tough fiber of the Londoners, whose forebears played a leading part in the establishment of Parliamentary institutions and who have been bred to value freedom far above their lives. This wicked man, the repository and embodiment of many forms of soul-destroying hatred, this monstrous product of former wrongs and shame, has now resolved to try to break our famous Island race by a process of indiscriminate slaughter and destruction. What he has done is to kindle a fire in British hearts, here and all over the world, which will glow long after all traces of the conflagration he has caused in London have been removed.

Broadcast on September 11, 1940 1.6 CHAR9/144/68

3. “I have the honour to add a pendant to the necklace of that Christmas good will and kindliness with which my illustrious friend, the President, has encircled the homes and families of the United States by the message of Christmas eve which he has just delivered.”

December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House (5.1 CHAR 9/153/3)

Note: Christmas Eve, December 24th, in Washington, D.C. is early morning December 25th in London
4. “I spend this anniversary and festival far from my country, far from my family, yet I cannot truthfully say that I feel far from home. Whether it be the ties of blood on my mother's side, or the friendships I have developed here over many years of active life, or the commanding sentiment of comradeship in the common cause of great peoples who speak the same language, who kneel at the same altars and, to a very large extent, pursue the same ideals, I cannot feel myself a stranger here in the centre and at the summit of the United States. I feel a sense of unity and fraternal association which, added to the kindliness of your welcome, convinces me that I have a right to sit at your fireside and share your Christmas joys.

December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House (5.2 CHAR 9/153/4

5. To fight in defence of his native land is the first duty of the citizen. But to fight in defence of some one else's native land is a different proposition. It may also be a sacred obligation, but it involves a higher conception. Willingly to cross the ocean and fight for strangers, far from home, upon an issue in the making of which one has had no say, requires a wide outlook upon human affairs and a sense of world responsibility. Canada, Australia, New Zealand, drawn by common citizenship under the Crown, had from the outset revealed this noble power of comprehension, and had made their decision good across broader spaces on the battlefields of three years. They had endured slaughters which no American army was destined to know, and their achievements are upon record. But the decision which in the emergency President Wilson took to remedy the consequences of previous long delay involved personal deprivations of a peculiar kind for the soldiers of the United States. To serve in one's national army, under one's own leader, amid a great mass of men animated by a common spirit is one ordeal. To serve in isolated divisions or brigades or even regiments under the orders of foreign Generals, flanked on either side by troops of different race and language and of unknown comradeship or quality, is another. Amid the hardships and terrors of war the soldier is accustomed to find his last remaining comfort of mind in being with his own friends and fellow-countrymen, sustained by the esprit de corps at least of 'The Battalion.' But in the dire need of the great struggle and in a loyal desire to share the tribulations of their allies, American soldiers by scores of thousands readily obeyed orders from their Government to serve, albeit under the general supervision of Pershing, as isolated companies or even platoons in British or French units in order that the largest number might come under the fire of the enemy at an earlier period.”


What impact does each term have on the listener?
When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work, shown in the J. Pierpoint Morgan Library exhibits as noted.

“III. ACCUMULATION OF ARGUMENT. The climax of oratory is reached by a rapid succession of waves of sound and vivid pictures. The audience is delighted by the changing scenes presented to their imagination. Their ear is tickled by the rhythm of the language. The enthusiasm rises. A series of facts is brought forward all pointing in a common direction. The end appears in view before it is reached. The crowd anticipate the conclusion and the last words fall amid a thunder of assent.”

Accumulation of argument is more difficult to discern in extracts exhibited here. However, if you read the following excerpts and underline the words that reveal Churchill’s determination to be inclusive, you will have a sense of his desire to have all aspects “brought forward all pointing in a common direction”:

1. Therefore, we must regard the next week or so as a very important period in our history. It ranks with the days when the Spanish Armada was approaching the Channel, and Drake was finishing his game of bowls; or when Nelson stood between us and Napoleon's Grand Army at Boulogne. We have read all about this in the history books; but what is happening now is on a far greater scale and of far more consequence to the life and future of the world and its civilization than these brave old days of the past. Every man and woman will therefore prepare himself to do his duty, whatever it may be, with special pride and care. Our fleets and flotillas are very powerful and numerous; our Air Force is at the highest strength it has ever reached, and it is conscious of its proved superiority, not indeed in numbers, but in men and machines. Our shores are well fortified and strongly manned, and behind them, ready to attack the invaders, we have a far larger and better equipped mobile Army than we have ever had before. Besides this, we have more than a million and a half men of the Home Guard, who are just as much soldiers of the Regular Army as the Grenadier Guards, and who are determined to fight for every inch of the ground in every village and in every street.
   Broadcast on September 11, 1940 (1.4 CHAR 9/176A/40 )

2. Little does he know the spirit of the British nation, or the tough fiber of the Londoners, whose forebears played a leading part in the establishment of Parliamentary institutions and who have been bred to value freedom far above their lives. This wicked man, the repository and embodiment of many forms of soul-destroying hatred, this monstrous product of former wrongs and shame, has now resolved to try to break our famous Island race by a process of indiscriminate slaughter and destruction. What he has done is to kindle a fire in British hearts, here and all over the world, which will glow long after all traces of the conflagration he has caused in London have been removed.
   Broadcast on September 11, 1940 1.6 CHAR9/144/68

3. “I have the honour to add a pendant to the necklace of that Christmas good will and kindliness with which my illustrious friend, the President, has encircled the homes and families of the United States by the message of Christmas eve which he has just delivered.”
   December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House (5.1 CHAR 9/153/3)
   Note: Christmas Eve, December 24th, in Washington, D.C. is early morning December 25th in London
4. “I spend this anniversary and festival far from my country, far from my family, yet I cannot truthfully say that I feel far from home. Whether it be the ties of blood on my mother's side, or the friendships I have developed here over many years of active life, or the commanding sentiment of comradeship in the common cause of great peoples who speak the same language, who kneel at the same altars and, to a very large extent, pursue the same ideals, I cannot feel myself a stranger here in the centre and at the summit of the United States. I feel a sense of unity and fraternal association which, added to the kindliness of your welcome, convinces me that I have a right to sit at your fireside and share your Christmas joys.

December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House

5. To fight in defence of his native land is the first duty of the citizen. But to fight in defence of some one else's native land is a different proposition. Willingly to cross the ocean and fight for strangers, far from home, upon an issue in the making of which one has had no say, requires a wide outlook upon human affairs and a sense of world responsibility. Canada, Australia, New Zealand, drawn by common citizenship under the Crown, had from the outset revealed this noble power of comprehension, and had made their decision good across broader spaces on the battlefields of three years. They had endured slaughters which no American army was destined to know, and their achievements are upon record. But the decision which in the emergency President Wilson took to remedy the consequences of previous long delay involved personal deprivations of a peculiar kind for the soldiers of the United States. To serve in one's national army, under one's own leader, amid a great mass of men animated by a common spirit is one ordeal. To serve in isolated divisions or brigades or even regiments under the orders of foreign Generals, flanked on either side by troops of different race and language and of unknown comradeship or quality, is another. Amid the hardships and terrors of war the soldier is accustomed to find his last remaining comfort of mind in being with his own friends and fellow-countrymen, sustained by the esprit de corps at least of 'The Battalion.' But in the dire need of the great struggle and in a loyal desire to share the tribulations of their allies, American soldiers by scores of thousands readily obeyed orders from their Government to serve, albeit under the general supervision of Pershing, as isolated companies or even platoons in British or French units in order that the largest number might come under the fire of the enemy at an earlier period.”

The World Crisis, chapter “The Unfought Campaign” pp. 471-2

What impact does each term have on the listener?
When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work. Letters and numbers in parentheses following each quote are document identification information from The Churchill Archives Centre.

“IV-a. ANALOGY. The affection of the mind for argument by analogy may afford a fertile theme to the cynical philosopher. The ambition of human beings to extend their knowledge favours the belief that the unknown is only an extension of the known: that the abstract and the concrete are ruled by similar principles: that the finite and the infinite are homogeneous. An apt analogy connects or appears to connect these distant spheres. It appeals to the everyday knowledge of the hearer….Whether they translate an established truth into simple language or whether they adventurously aspire to reveal the unknown, they are among the most formidable weapons of the rhetorician.”

ANALOGIES
Read the following excerpts and identify the analogies, noting both the concrete symbol and the abstract idea each represents:

1. “What he [Hitler] has done is to kindle a fire in British hearts, here and all over the world, which will glow long after all traces of the conflagration he has caused in London have been removed. He has lighted a fire which will burn with a steady and consuming flame until the last vestiges of Nazi tyranny have been burnt out of Europe, and until the Old World - and the New - can join hands to rebuild the temples of man's freedom and man's honour, upon foundations which will not soon or easily be overthrown.

Broadcast, September 11, 1940 (1.6 CHAR 9/144/68)

2. “I have the honour to add a pendant to the necklace of that Christmas good will and kindliness with which my illustrious friend, the President, has encircled the homes and families of the United States by the message of Christmas eve which he has just delivered.”

December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House (5.1 CHAR 9/153/3)

Note: Christmas Eve, December 24th, in Washington, D.C. is early morning December 25th in London

3. “I feel a sense of unity and fraternal association which, added to the kindliness of your welcome, convinces me that I have a right to sit at your fireside and share your Christmas joys.”

December 25, 1941 Christmas broadcast from White House (5.2 CHAR 9/153/4)

4. Following from Prime Minister to Captain and ships company of U.S.S. WASP. 11.5.42.

[May 5, 1942]

Many thanks to you all for timely help. Who said a wasp couldn’t sting twice?

(Signed) Winston Churchill

Telegram from WSC to USS Wasp (metaphor) (10.6.1 CHAR 20/75/13)

5. “Man has parted company with his trusty friend the horse and sailed into the azure with the eagles”

broadcast speech at Harvard, September 6, 1943 (10.9 CHAR 9/196A/36)

6. “I was invited to give my counsel freely in this free country and I am sure that the hope which I expressed for the increasing association of our two countries will come to pass, not because of any speech which may be made, but because of the tides that flow in human affairs and in the course of the unfolding destiny of the world.”

March 15, 1946, New York City, follow up to Fulton Speech (11.2.1 CHUR 5/4C/106)

7. “I am surprised to read the cataract of condemnation poured out upon my head two days ago by Generalissimo Stalin.” Note: Stalin’s name did not appear at all in the final version of Churchill’s speech

March 15, 1946, New York City, follow up to Fulton Speech (11.2.2 CHUR 5/4C/108)
### IV-a. ANALOGIES WORKSHEET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document: CHAR 9/144/68</th>
<th>Concrete Object:</th>
<th>Abstract Idea:</th>
<th>Basis for similarity:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/153/3</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/153/4</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 20/75/13</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/196A/36</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHUR 5/4C/106</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHUR 5/4C/108</td>
<td>Concrete Object:</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### IV-a. ANALOGIES Answer Key

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document: CHAR 9/144/68</th>
<th>Concrete Object: Fire</th>
<th>Abstract Idea: patriotism</th>
<th>Basis for similarity: We speak of “burning passions” and view patriotism as all-consuming. Both fire and patriotism spread easily, both may get out of control. Image of something new arising from ashes (Old World and New World…build on new foundations)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/153/3</td>
<td>Concrete Object: pendant</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Great value</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Cherished, valued relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 20/75/13</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Naval ship named WASP</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: defensive action</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Both sting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/196A/36</td>
<td>Concrete Object: horse, eagles</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: tied to the land without boundaries, broad horizons</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: limited, limitless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHUR 5/4C/106</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Tides</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Changing politics</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: ebb and flow of history, which seems to repeat but may only echo powerful and dangerous</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14
The Scaffolding of Rhetoric IV-b.
IV-b. Allusions as Implied Analogies Work Sheet

When Winston Churchill was just twenty-three years old, he composed an essay titled “The Scaffolding of Rhetoric,” in which he proposed “six principal elements” that should be the foundation of all rhetoric, noting that “The subtle art of combining the various elements that separately mean nothing and collectively mean so much in an harmonious proportion is known to a very few.” This unfinished essay discusses only four elements in detail; let us apply those four elements of Churchill’s advice to his own work, shown in the J. Pierpoint Morgan Library exhibits as noted.

IV-b. ALLUSIONS AS IMPLIED ANALOGIES
An allusion is a reference to a literary or historic event, myth, or work of art. What is alluded to in each quotation? How might each be construed as an analogy, drawing a comparison between different things?

1.4 CHAR 9/176A/68 “…a very important week…. It ranks with the days when the Spanish Armada was approaching the Channel, or when Nelson stood between us and Napoleon’s Grand Army at Boulogne.”

9.16 CHAR 8/518A/34 “It is this which will determine whether [Hitler] will rank in Valhalla with Pericles, with Augustus, and with Washington, or welter in the inferno of human scorn with Attila and Tamerlane” (page 11)

11.5 CHUR 5/24E/730 “But these 14 men in the Kremlin have their hierarchy and a church of Communist adepts whose missionaries are in every country as a fifth column.”
### IV-b ALLUSIONS AS IMPLIED ANALOGIES WORK SHEET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document: CHAR 9/176A/68</th>
<th>Concrete Object: Spanish Armada</th>
<th>Abstract Idea: Battle for survival of the nation</th>
<th>Basis for similarity: Both European nations (Spain and Germany) threatened to invade England</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/176A/68</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Nelson’s Battle with Napoleon</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 8/518A/34</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Valhalla</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 8/518A/34</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Inferno</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHUR 5/24E/730</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Fifth column</td>
<td>Abstract Idea:</td>
<td>Basis for similarity:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/176A/68</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Spanish Armada</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Battle for survival of the nation</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Both European nations (Spain and Germany) threatened to invade England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 9/176A/68</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Nelson’s Battle with Napoleon</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Battle for survival of the nation</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Both European nations (France and Germany) threatened to conquer England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHAR 8/518A/34</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Inferno Attila, Tamerlane</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Hell, particularly for those who betray their countrymen Evil men who were responsible for great destruction at home and abroad.</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Hitler may destroy Germany, along with other vital states.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document: CHUR 5/24E/730</td>
<td>Concrete Object: Fifth column</td>
<td>Abstract Idea: Subversive elements within a country ready to join with the enemy</td>
<td>Basis for similarity: Communist cells operating within countries</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>